



harjito upgris <harjito@upgris.ac.id>

submission

1 pesan

harjito upgris <harjito@upgris.ac.id>

7 September 2021 pukul 06.01

Kepada: KERVAN Scientific Staff <mauro.tosco@unito.it>

To The Honorable
Editor Board Kervan Journal

I do hereby would like to submit my research paper entitled “The Cuisine Is Not Enough:
Transformation of Women in the 2000s Indonesian Short Stories”.

My paper discusses about encouraging women to have an income other than their husband's salary is one way for women to become more independent.

I wishes you will review and determine my journal. For more information just let me know as soon as possible.

best regard,

Harjito
Universitas PGRI Semarang, Indonesia

**0921cuisine.docx**

60K



harjito upgris <harjito@upgris.ac.id>

(tanpa subjek)

2 pesan

harjito upgris <harjito@upgris.ac.id>

8 November 2021 pukul 08.26

Kepada: KERVAN Scientific Staff <mauro.tosco@unito.it>

Dear Mauro Tosco,

On September 7, 2021, I sent an email about my article entitled "The Cuisine is Not Enough: Transformation of Women in the 2000s Indonesian Short Stories".

I am sorry to bother you as to let me know about the status of the article.

best regard,
Harjito

Mauro Tosco <mauro.tosco@unito.it>

8 November 2021 pukul 09.29

Kepada: harjito upgris <harjito@upgris.ac.id>

Dear Harjito,

I apologize for the delay, but it has been very difficult to find competent and willing anonymous referees for your article. I have been promised the reviews for this very week, and I will let you know as soon as I have the reviews.

With my best regards,

Mauro

Prof. Mauro Tosco
African Linguistics,
University of Turin,
Dept. of Humanities (StudiUm),
[v. Giulia di Barolo 3 A](#)
[I-10124 Torino/Turin](#)

phone: (+39) 011 670 38 53

mail: mauro.tosco@unito.it

web: www.maurotosco.net

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]



harjito upgris <harjito@upgris.ac.id>

your submission to "Kervan"

5 pesan

Mauro Tosco <mauro.tosco@unito.it>
Kepada: harjito upgris <harjito@upgris.ac.id>

11 November 2021 pukul 18.07

Dear Harjito,

As I promised, I have now received two referee's reports on the article you submitted to "Kervan".

Both the referees think that your work is in principle interesting and acceptable for publication, but they also stress that much work is needed in order to improve it. Both referees have added detailed comments on the manuscript. I attach them for your reference and help you in the revision.

A referee writes:

QUOTE

The article is interesting and opens a window – even to non-experts – on the literary perception of the female condition in the country. However, the author makes no reference to women's associations or the women's rights movements that instead carry out important awareness campaigns, in and out of the country, to untie the social knots that still tend to relegate women to a circuit of traditional 'functions'. It is therefore suggested to the author to add a greater contextualization of the female figure also in the light of what happens around her social condition.

UNQUOTE

Another referee writes:

QUOTE

The text is pertinent to the objectives of the journal as it contributes to the discussion of Indonesian cultural and literary studies. However, the essay has not engaged with current research in the field and needs more work to meet the scientific levels required by an academic periodical.

The writing shows promise by viewing texts that take on 'cooking' and 'kitchen' as important symbols, and this is quite original and novel to the field of Indonesian literature. However, the writer has not conducted deep reading to understand the layers of meaning communicated through the images of 'cooking' and 'cuisine', and the significance of these images to Indonesian culture and values. In the analysis, the writer instead mixes the theme of cooking with women's bodies (particularly in Part 3.1. and 3.2), and this takes the discussion away from what the significance of cooking and cuisine in the stories and the figurative meanings that these actions and objects serve. Please see detailed comments below.

The text does not show a clear argument and/or research question. It is difficult to see the link and the coherence between three sub-sections of analyses (detailed comments can be found in the manuscript).

Also, the author does not provide a comprehensive literature review about the topic that they wish to tackle and does not consider the historical development of studies about women literature in Indonesia as well as the issue of domesticity (for instance, Julia Suryakusuma, Manneke Budiman, Aquarini Priyatna's work). The writer also does not mention the different points of view on this matter. Instead, the writer mentions unnecessary sources about the importance of prose and poems. This part will need to be eliminated from the writing and replaced by a robust literature review specific to the paper's topic. References to other readings are made loosely in discussions (particularly discussion parts 2 and 3), but these are not comprehensively discussed nor do they give a view of how scholars have tackled the issue of domesticity in Indonesian literature.

The article also needs intense proofreading to check the grammatical and syntactical errors. In many parts, readers have difficulty following the author's views due to the awkward sentences and phrases. The article also exhibits problems in organization and paragraph structures. Paragraphs should start with a clear topic sentence and/or argument that the writer then elaborates in the paragraph.

The topic of this article is insightful, that is about women and cooking in Indonesian contemporary literature. However, this article needs more work to meet the standard of an academic journal. The author needs to clearly state the research problem and the research question(s), rewrite the introduction, methods, finding and results, and conclusion. Reviewers have provided detailed comments in the manuscript to address each section.

There is no clear argument posed in this writing. Hints of an argument were mentioned in Part 3.2 and 3.3, as the writer mentions briefly that the women are showing resistance for being 'contained' to their duty in the kitchen. The writer mentions that there are "dynamics of the meaning of cuisine" and that there is "manifestation of feminine resistance", but these ideas were not made front and center. These ideas also were not elaborated, thus leaving readers questioning what is this 'dynamics of meaning'? What does it look like? How do we make meaning to the women's resistance? To do this, the writer should first explain the existing scholarship on the topic of domesticity in Indonesian cultural and literary studies, and seek connection between the existing scholarship and the article. This essay makes efforts to connect women's ability to cook, their resistance through cooking, obsession over slim figures, and the ability to earn money. However, the writing has not managed to assemble a clear argument that makes a clear connection on how these issues are linked. Furthermore, the discussion of empowerment through earning money and climbing the social ladder rather simplifies how cuisine and cooking are used as symbols in the stories, thereby overlooking the complex relationship that Indonesian women have with domesticity.

Lastly, the writing shows many grammar mistakes and problems with sentence structure as well as a lack of organization between paragraphs. I highly suggest the writer consult with a proofreader to solve this matter.

I view that the writing needs major revision and can be resubmitted to the journal to be re-evaluated by reviewers.

UNQUOTE

As you see, the article is in principle publishable, but it needs many, many changes, corrections and improvements.

Please let me know at your earliest convenience if:

1. you accept to modify your text and take into account the referees' proposals and criticisms.
2. If you want to try and you think you will manage to improve the text and send me back your final and revised version within NOVEMBER 30

In this case, it could still be published in issue 25/2, to be published at the end of the year or the first days of 2022 (but in any case with publication date 2021).

3. If you accept to change the text but you will not manage to do it by the end of November, it could be published in issue 26 in the second half of 2022.

I realize that there is much to change and modify, so maybe if you take your time and we'll publish your work next year you will provide a better revised version. But tell me what you prefer.

If you want to send me the revised version, please also send me some biographical data (a few lines each) for EACH and all the authors. These biographical notes should end with each author's email address, if you and they want the email address to be published.

Please also note that "Harjito" is not enough for our records: both a personal and a family name is needed. Sorry about that!

Looking forward to hearing from you soon,
all the best

Mauro Tosco
(scientific director of "Kervan")

Prof. Mauro Tosco
African Linguistics,
University of Turin,
Dept. of Humanities (StudiUm),
[v. Giulia di Barolo 3 A](#)
[I-10124 Torino/Turin](#)

phone: (+39) 011 670 38 53
mail: mauro.tosco@unito.it
web: www.maurotosco.net

2 lampiran

 **WOMEN_INDONESIA_KERVAN_REFEREE #1_NOTES.docx**
68K

 **WOMEN_INDONESIA_KERVAN_REFEREE #2_NOTES.docx**
71K

harjito upgris <harjito@upgris.ac.id>
Kepada: Mauro Tosco <mauro.tosco@unito.it>

13 November 2021 pukul 07.51

Dear Mauro Tosco,

Thank you for your kindness and quick reply.
I have carefully read your email and read the referrer's notes.
I accept and will change the paper according to the proposal and criticism of the referee's.
I have a lot to revise and I have to be realistic that it takes time to modify my manuscript, including the need for intense proofreading.
Therefore, I would be grateful if the article could be considered for a second half of 2022.
I promise and try to provide a better revision as soon as possible.
I am very grateful for your deep appreciation.

Best regards.

Harjito

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

Mauro Tosco <mauro.tosco@unito.it>
Kepada: harjito upgris <harjito@upgris.ac.id>

14 November 2021 pukul 15.46

Dear Harjito,

Thank you so much for this information.
In any case, I will keep the "window" open until the first days of December, in case you manage to produce the final version in time.
All the best,

Mauro

Prof. Mauro Tosco
African Linguistics,
University of Turin,
Dept. of Humanities (StudiUm),
v. Giulia di Barolo 3 A

I-10124 Torino/Turin

phone: (+39) 011 670 38 53

mail: mauro.tosco@unito.it

web: www.maurotosco.net

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

harjito upgris <harjito@upgris.ac.id>
Kepada: Mauro Tosco <mauro.tosco@unito.it>

20 Desember 2021 pukul 17.31

Dear Mauro Tosco

I apologize for taking so long to revise my paper.

After reading carefully and thoroughly the notes from the referrer, I hereby send you a revision of the article.

At the end after references, I include some biographical data of all the authors.

Herewith I also send a certificate of "proofreader".

I accept if it needs to be revised again.

Thank you for your deep appreciation

Best regards

Harjito

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

2 lampiran

 **harjito-women-rev.docx**
73K

 **Enago-Certificate.pdf**
178K

Mauro Tosco <mauro.tosco@unito.it>
Kepada: harjito upgris <harjito@upgris.ac.id>

21 Desember 2021 pukul 01.27

Dear Harjito,

I do not think another revision will be needed but I will go into the article more closely as soon as possible.

Thank you again for your interest in Kervan.

Best,

Mauro

1/28/23, 9:30 AM

Email upgris - your submission to "Kervan"

Prof. Mauro Tosco
African Linguistics,
University of Turin,
Dept. of Humanities (StudiUm),
v. Giulia di Barolo 3 A
I-10124 Torino/Turin

phone: (+39) 011 670 38 53
mail: mauro.tosco@unito.it
web: www.maurotosco.net

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]